



CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

August 15th, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on August 15th, 2024, at 9:30 a.m. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center Building. Chairman Skip Pond called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m..

Roll Call: Admin Support Shelby Ogle called the roll.

Members Present: Skip Pond, Piper Stromatt, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan, Brandon Panganiban, Matt McDonald, John Brennan, Clif McCormick

Members Absent: Dana Moody

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline, Admin Support Shelby Ogle, and Staff Attorney Andrew Trundle

Swearing In: Admin Support Shelby Ogle swore in people addressing the Committee.

Applicant(s) Present: Sarah McCurter, Jason Craven, Blake and Erynn Cash, Karen Wynne, Steve Kovatch

Rules and Regulations: Chairman Skip Pond explained the rules and procedures, order of business, and announced the meeting is being recorded.

Approve Minutes: Chairman Skip Pond presented the July 18th, 2024 Meeting Minutes to be voted on. No amendments need to be made. *John Brennan* motioned to **APPROVE** the July minutes. *Nathan Bird* seconded the motion. **All in favor. The motion carries 8-0.**

Staff Review Cases: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the Staff Review cases to the Commission.

- **HZ-24-42:** 5005 Virginia Ave.: Exterior Rehabilitation
- **HZ-24-69:** 4301 St. Elmo Ave.: Fence
- **HZ-24-75:** 315 Old Mountain Rd.: Demolition of Non-Historic Outbuilding
- **HZ-24-76:** 5522 Alabama Ave.: Fence
- **HZ-24-77:** 4409 Alabama Ave.: Fence

OLD BUSINESS

- **HZ-24-50 - 117 Morningside Dr. - Revision to COA: Skylights (Stop Work Order)**

Applicant requested to withdraw the case.

Community Response: Chair Skip Pond opened the floor to the community who showed up in regards to the case. Multiple members of the Ferger Place community were present to express their concerns over the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the skylights as well as the revision case that was due to be heard.

NEW BUSINESS

- HZ-24-27: 1709 W. 43rd St. - Exterior Rehabilitation for Primary Dwelling + ADU (Stop Work Order)

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.8 Doors, Page 40
- 6.13 Foundations, Page 45
- 6.22 New Construction Page 52
- 6.25 Porches, Porch Columns Railings, Page 59
- 6.33 Siding, Page 70
- 6.41 Windows, Page 7

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Sarah McCurter of 1709 W 43rd St. presented to the Commission for the owner of the property that they are wanting to rehabilitate the accessory dwelling unit in the back of the property as well as rehabilitate the main structure on the property. She was unsure of how to respond to questions about certain aspects of the project that Staff posed. She did state that they intended to replace all the windows on the property due them being rotted.

Community Response: Eric Smith of 209 Eveningside Dr., presented to the Commission that he believes that Staff does a great job of presenting the cases to the Board. He also wanted to remind the Commission that per their guidelines and bylaws; they are required to include the specifics behind each approval decision for each case.

Applicant Response to Community: Applicant did not wish to respond.

Discussion: The Commission discussed that it appears to be wood siding under that siding that is currently existing on the structures. They stated that they could not see the condition the windows are in from the pictures and documentation that was provided and Staff was not able to do a site visit prior to the meeting. They discussed with the Applicant about renovating the existing accessory structure instead of rebuilding a new one and that is what they intend to do. The Commission discussed that they do not believe they have enough information from the Applicant's application as well as the Applicant not being able to discuss all aspects of the case. The Commission recommended the case be deferred to give the Applicant more time to work with Staff to provide all the information they need to make a decision.

Commission Motion and Vote:

- Clif McCormick made a motion to **DEFER** case #: HZ-24-27: 1709 W 43rd St.
Nathan Bird seconded the motion.
All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

- HZ-24-70: 5002 Florida Ave. - Remove Existing Carport + Asphalt Driveway, Construct New Carport/Shed and Concrete Driveway

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.9 Driveways & Parking, Page 41
- 6.22 New Construction, Page 52

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Jason Craven of 5002 Florida Ave. was representing the owner as the general contractor. He presented to the Commission that the owner of the property reached out with the desire to improve the carport area. He mentioned that several neighboring houses have a double driveway.

Community Response: Eric Smith of 209 Eveningside Dr., presented before the Commission and asked that they follow their guidelines and bylaws and wanted to remind them that they are required to include the specifics behind each approval decision for each case.

Applicant Response to Community: Applicant did not wish to respond to the Community comment, but wanted to specify that in the designs that they presented to the Commission that they plan to mimic historical features of the existing house to the proposed carport/shed.

Discussion: The Commission discussed that given the way the motions are made they do not think they need to adjust the process to go item by item of each request in each case, but referred to the City Attorney to research. The Commission then discussed the placement for the proposed carport/shed, stating that most of the time accessory structures are located in the backyard and not the side yard and this is proposed to be in the side yard of the property. They discussed with the Applicant that there does not appear to be any access to the backyard.

Commission Motion and Vote:

- *Brandon Panganiban* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-70: 5002 Florida Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

- **HZ-24-72: 4302 Seneca Ave. - Front Porch + Addition**

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions, Pg. 33

Applicant Presentation: Applicants Blake and Erynn Cash of 4302 Seneca Ave. presented to the Commission that they are wanting to redo the front porch to create a landing pad and allow the space to navigate getting inside the house. They are also wanting to close in the back porch and mimic the shed that is also on the property. They also stated that there are neighbors who have similar additions on their dwellings.

Community Response: Eric Smith of 209 Eveningside Dr., presented before the Commission and thanked the Applicants of the case for displaying the public notice sign so clearly. He then discussed further about the Commission's guidelines and bylaws in regards to ensuring the relevant ordinances are said in the motions for cases.

Applicant Response to Community: Applicant did not wish to respond.

Discussion: The Commission discussed the shape of the proposed roof of the addition in the back. The existing house has a gable roof and the proposed addition has a slope roof to allow for more headroom in the room. The Commission then discusses the front porch and how there is precedent that speaks to not changing the front facade of historic homes. They then discussed whether the home was truly historic or just built before the historic guidelines were created and implemented. The Commission and the Applicants discussed that the rear addition is not visible from any street view and the Applicants believe that the proposed front porch changes enhance the neighborhood.

Commission Motion and Vote:

- *Nathan Bird* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-72: 4302 Seneca Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Clif McCormick seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

- **HZ-24-73: 4905 Florida Ave. - Parking**

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.9 Driveways & Parking, Page 41

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Karen Wynne of 4905 Florida Ave presented to the Commission that she is proposing a new driveway, because she stated that the back of her backyard stays soggy and floods when it rains; that means she cannot park in that area and has to park right behind the house. She also stated that she has to get a

running start to exit off her existing driveway and it is unsafe and dangerous. She stated she wants to preserve the historic sidewalks, but needs to make changes to the current curb cut to make the driveway safer.

Community Response:

- Shelby Verheuvall of 4907 Florida Ave expressed concern over the access to the alley that is for both houses to use. She expressed that the fence that was built impedes on the access to the alley and the backyard.
- Allyson King of 1177 Leconte Cir presented to the Commission that she is Shelby Verheuvall's mother and a retired real estate agent and stated that her daughter is moving from Alabama to Chattanooga. She stated they are fine with sharing the alley/driveway, but would not have bought the house had they known that there would be so many issues with it.
- Charity Martin of 4412 St. Elmo Ave presented to the Commission some history on the house that Shelby Verheuvall now owns. She stated that there was a temporary use agreement between both owners before they were sold that allowed for use and care of the alley between properties. She stated that the fence that was built blocks the access for both owners.

Staff Clarification: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline provided some clarification to the Commission that she worked with Transportation Specialist Caleb Fisher on approving the fence and the issues with the alley access. She stated that the fence is within the Applicant's property lines and Transportation is still working with the Applicant on the alley.

Applicant Response to Community: The Applicant responded by stating that she apologizes for any misinformation that was given about the alley access and fence. She stated that the size of the lots and narrowness of the roads means it is not safe to park on the roadways.

Discussion: The Commission discussed refocusing the discussion back to the case and what is in their purview. One member stated that the driveway should not be in front of the property as it goes against the guidelines. They also discussed potential deferral due to the unresolved issues with the alleyway. They also discussed that the Applicant can access the rear yard to park from the alleyway which is better than making a new curb cut into the historic sidewalks. The Commission stated that they do not feel comfortable making a decision on the case until the legality of the alleyway access is resolved.

Commission Motion and Vote:

- *Nathan Bird* made a motion to **DEFER** case #: HZ-24-73: 4905 Florida Ave.
Matt McDonald seconded the motion.
All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

- **HZ-24-74: 4910 Beulah Ave. - Addition**

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions, Pg. 33

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Steve Kovatch of 4910 Beulah Ave presented to the Commission that he is a builder/woodworker in the neighborhood and that the existing addition is currently pulling away from the existing house and pulling on the rear wall causing damage. He stated that it is getting past the point of just repairing it and needs to be redone. He stated that they are wanting to start a family in the next year and need more safe space. He stated that he believes he can salvage most of the windows and redo the roof to match the existing. He provided clarification that they plan to use the existing doors on the inside of the addition for bedroom doors.

Community Response: Eric Smith of 209 Eveningside Dr., presented before the Commission a reminder to refer back to the language of their guidelines and bylaws that the Commission 'should' include the summary of findings in their motions and the Commission assumed it meant must.

Applicant Response to Community: Applicant did not wish to respond.

Discussion: The Commission began the discussion with asking the Applicant some questions about the roof design as well as the plans for the historic rear wall of the house. The Applicant stated that they plan to keep the rear wall, headers, and main structures. He stated that they plan to make the addition match the original house and keep the historic features.

Commission Motion and Vote:

- Matt McDonald made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-74: 4910 Beulah Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:
 - Applicant to save and use the historic windows which are viable.
 - Rear door to be Staff approved.
 - Trim size of addition to match the original.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

All in favor. **The motion carries 7-0.**

Other Business

Next Meeting Date: September 19th, 2024 (Application deadline is August 16th, 2024 at 4pm).

Historic Guidelines Update: The City will be holding neighborhood meetings for the updates to the Historic Guidelines towards the end of September. There will be a presentation directly after the meeting for the Commission from the Consultants leading the updates.

Commission Discussions: Nathan Bird stated that it would be great if Staff could check into adding the recordings from the meetings onto the website for the public to reference and Staff stated that they would look into it. The Commission then asked the City Attorney about updating/amending the bylaws and if that was something the Commission could do or not. He stated that the Commission has the authority to make amendments to the bylaws.

Clif McCormick motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Piper Stromatt seconded the motion.

All in favor.


Meeting was adjourned at 11:43 a.m..



Skip Pond, Chairman

9/19/2024

Date



Shelby Ogle, Admin

9-19-24

Date

