#### MEETING OF THE TRUSTEES

#### CITY OF CHATTANOOGA GENERAL PENSION PLAN

### February 20, 2025

This regularly scheduled meeting of the City of Chattanooga General Pension Plan Board of Trustees was held on February 20, 2025 at 8:30 a.m. in the Veranda Room, City Hall Building. Trustees present were Daisy Madison, Aon Miller, Jeffrey Wilson, Katie Reinsmidt, Collin Thau, and Javaid Majid. Others in attendance at the meeting were Chris Crevasse, Miller & Martin, Inc.; Valerie Malueg, Office of the City Attorney; Weston Porter, City Finance Department; Jed Cooper, First Horizon Bank (by phone); Melody Wingfield, Dessalyn Sammons, Starla Benjamin, Jason Silvers and Cheryl Powell, City Human Resources Department.

Definitions in the document: GPP is General Pension Plan, OPEB is Other Post-Employment Benefits

The meeting was called to order by Chair Daisy Madison. A quorum was present at the beginning of the meeting.

#### **Approval of Minutes**

Aon Miller made a motion to approve the minutes from the November 21, 2024 meeting. Katie Reinsmidt seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

Cheryl pointed out a minor change that is needed in the December 13, 2024 minutes.

Aon Miller made a motion to approve the minutes, as amended, from the December 13, 2024 meeting. Katie Reinsmidt seconded the motion. The minutes were approved as amended.

#### **Administrative Actions**

Cheryl Powell presented the Administrative Actions for the quarter. Retirement activity was heavier during the end of the year with 27 retirements recorded on this report. Five retirees exercised the option to receive a DROP payment amounting to \$439,875.22. There was one employee death where the beneficiary received a 10 year certain annuity. Termination activity was normal with relatively low benefits for all but one vested deferred who elected a refund of contributions. There were three retiree deaths with a return of basis. For the General Pension fund, there was a distribution received from Golden Tree Distressed Fund III distributed a total of \$25,600. The approved transaction redeeming \$2 from Pointer to cash for benefit payments was completed.

In the OPEB Trust, the board approved transfers from Cash to the Pointer Offshore Ltd, Ironwood International Ltd, Eaton Vance Multi-Asset Credit and Johnson Institutional Core Bond funds in OPEB were transacted.

Cheryl also reminded the Trustees of the Pension Board Funding Policy in preparation for the upcoming valuation.

Katie Reinsmidt made a motion to approve administrative actions. Aon Miller seconded the motion. The administrative actions were approved.

#### Purchasing Policy update - Javaid Majid

Javaid, stated that at this point, a written policy has not been drafted. There are three options that are to be considered:

- to operate independently using an external entity to manage the process, or
- to use City as an agent for the board, or
- a hybrid plan, where the board will devise their own plan with City to help manage the process

Eventually this will be presented to the Board in written form and the Board will need to approve the policy. Once the Board approves the written policy, it will be brought before City Council for final approval.

Some discussion followed with the Board mainly concerned about their inclusion in the purchasing process. The requirements for open meetings were re-iterated that only 1 (one) board member can be involved in the evaluation of an RFP or RFQ if the City is managing the process. In this case, the Board will select the member to be involved in the evaluation and it does not have to be the Mayor's representative.

A draft of the policy is expected to be made available for review at the next meeting.

# Investment Performance Review 4Q2024 - CBIZ Investment Advisory Services

Due to icy weather conditions that created travel challenges, Scott Arnwine was not able to attend. However, Scott did send the main notes from his report and Cheryl Powell provided a copy to the Board members. A copy of the report will be made a part of the minutes.

The GPP fund ended the quarter and the year at \$373.8 M. Total return for the quarter was -0.4% while total return for the year was 9.7%. The equity managers ended the quarter with -0.6%. Large cap equity managers had positive results while international managers had negative results. Total fixed income was -3.4% while the global aggregate index was -5.1% and the US aggregate index was -3.1%. Fixed income results were helped by the positive results of the private debt funds and the Eaton Vance Multi-Asset fund. The return for the hedge funds for the quarter was 4.3% and both funds had positive results.

Looking ahead to the month of January, the fund was \$381 M and had a return of 2.2%. All managers had positive results.

For the OPEB Trust, the fund ended the quarter and the year at \$165.2 M. The total return for the quarter was 0.3% and the total return for the year was 12.8%. The results for OPEB are led by the greater weight in equities. For the month of January, the fund value increased to \$167.9 with a quarterly return of 2.0%.

Considering the upcoming asset allocation activity, the Board discussed their role as fiduciaries and the interaction with the investment consultants to make decisions about investment allocation and the manager selection. There was generally a consensus that interviewing managers for selection may not be the best use of their time. At the same time, there was interest expressed in having the local managers, Patten and Patten and Pointer, to periodically report in person to the board, perhaps every 5 years. The Board agreed they have an oversight responsibility to control the direction of the investment consultants, whether the approach is active or passive investments, and the level of risk in the portfolio.

#### **Election of Officers**

The three officers of the board are Chair Daisy Madison, Vice Chair Katie Reinsmidt and Secretary Aon Miller. After a short discussion, there was a call for nominations. No nominations were made.

Aon Miller made a motion to maintain the current slate of officers for another term: Chair Daisy Madison, Vice Chair Katie Reinsmidt and Secretary Aon Miller. Javaid Majid seconded the motion. The motion carried.

#### Report from First Horizon

There was no report from First Horizon.

# Report from Counsel

From the December special meeting, there was a decision that an appeals process needs to be formalized for the board. Valerie drafted a document for this purpose. Additionally, it was recommended to formalize the public

comment policy for the Board.

### Appeal Ordinance

Valerie Malueg presented the document for the Appeal Ordinance. She modeled the procedure after the process used by other boards. She went over the document with the Board explaining each provision of the process. The document provides a process to appeal the Board's decision in Chancery Court within 60 days.

There were a few comments pertaining to some of the references in the wording, time limits, when the proof is sufficient, and adjournment or the need to reconvene. Additionally, it should be clear in the procedure who is responsible and the method for notification to all parties about the need for a special meeting. Suggestions were made for changes to the wording. The amended document will be on the agenda at the next meeting for approval

The final approved document will be attached to the minutes.

#### **Public Comment Policy**

This policy was drafted to follow the policy of City Council and other boards. The rules for time, place and manner restrictions must be within the Board's authority and related to items on the current agenda or a pension matter. There are rules that are read before any commenter may speak. Commenters need to provide their name and district number. There was a question about who calls 'time' for the comment period.

This document will be on the agenda at the next meeting. The final approved document will be attached to the minutes.

#### General Pension Plan opinion on specific issues - Chris Crevasse

Chris Crevasse was asked to read and analyze the GPP and provide an opinion about specific workings of the GPP provisions focusing much of the attention on the definition of 'employee' and the rules for participation of "former" employees. In particular, the opinion covered how definitions may apply to "former" Fire or Police sworn employees, whether receiving their pension benefit or vested deferred, who are <u>rehired</u> by the City in civilian jobs.

His letter to the Office of the City Attorney office summarized his conclusions. Those conclusions are provided here.

- 1. The General Pension Plan does not exclude former Chattanooga firefighters and police officers from participating in the General Pension Plan, even if they are eligible for or are receiving pension benefits from the Fire and Police Pension Fund.
- 2. If former Chattanooga firefighters and police officers participate in the General Pension Plan, they will receive credited service under the General Pension Plan for the time they were participants in the Fire and Police Pension Fund.
- 3. If former Chattanooga firefighters and police officers participate in the General Pension Plan, their benefit under the General Pension Plan will be offset by the benefit they earned under the Fire and Police Pension Fund.
- 4. Excluding former Chattanooga firefighters and police officers from the General Pension Plan may be discriminatory as a "disparate impact".

Item #3 is designed to prevent double dipping so that the firefighter or police officer does not receive two pensions from the City. This applies regardless of whether they are retired and receiving a pension benefit from the Fire and Police Pension Fund (FPPF) or a vested deferred benefit, while working for the City in a civilian position. The offset is an actuarial calculation and comparison of the 'single sum' or present value of the two benefits.

Comment and question from the trustees: Retirement is a different category of employee; that is these are former employees. How does pension credit work with a civilian employee hired into a fire or police position? According to Chris, a civilian employee who transfers from a civilian job and becomes a sworn officer does not get credit for prior service in the Fire and Police pension fund.

Comment from the trustees: The scenarios presented for firefighters and police officers to include in the GPP describe current employees who are not former employees but instead are transfers from sworn officer jobs into civilian jobs with continuous service.

Valerie Malueg stated that the Private Acts which created the predecessor of the General Pension Plan (Employee's Insurance and Penson Fund) specifically excluded the Department of Fire and Police in each section of the bill. In Chris Crevasse's comments, the inconsistency is based on the definition of employee outlining who can participate in the GPP. The definition includes the discretion of the Board of Trustees to determine whether a person is an employee as defined. His interpretation of "employee" is in context as present tense, so current employees in the Fire and Police department are not considered an employee of the City for inclusion in the GPP. Inconsistencies in the definitions can be amended to clean up provisions.

Chris Crevasse addresses a reasonable factor other than age (RFOA) consideration: facially-neutral exclusions can be discriminatory and are subject to testing to ensure that they are not statistically significant. Chris makes this comment in the letter: "If a relatively small numbers of former firefighters or police officers become civilian employees of the City but are excluded from the GPP, the it is likely that the potential disparate impact would not fall below the 80% threshold and be statistically significant."

Chris's recommendation: Former firefighter and police officers hired as civilian employees can participate in the GPP, receive credit for time served, and be subject to the offset by actuarial comparison of single sum values of the two pensions.

Question/comment from trustees: Are the two pension plans separate entities or not? They have been treated as distinct in practice for years each having separate boards and oversight. The trustees suggest avoiding opening a "Pandora's box" in this situation.

Question from the trustees: How is pension service separated when the firefighter or police officer becomes a civilian employee with continuous service?

The trustees need to see examples and numbers regarding the calculation of benefits and the offset.

- Retiree rehired gets years of credit in GPP for the years worked in FPPF as well receiving the FPP retirement benefit?
- How does the offset calculation work?

The way the two plans are funded must be taken into consideration. The funds are not commingled but each has it own board and oversight. This was not addressed in Chris Crevasse's opinion. Employees only contribute to one plan, not both. The City makes an actuarial contribution to each plan based on the valuation of the benefits of its participants. Additionally, no firefighter or police officer records are kept for General Pension plan purposes.

An actuarial review will be required before any change can be made to current procedures. A request will be made to the actuary to conduct the review and analysis. This includes the two employee scenarios and example calculations of the offset as suggested by Daisy Madison:

- EE does not retire but transfers to another job and is no longer eligible for the former plan but may be eligible for another plan
- EE retires, is rehired and may be eligible for another plan
- Calculations of comparison values under the offset at time of payment commencement to determine which benefit is the larger amount.

The board will take under review the comments from today and the actuarial information, then make recommendations.

There was no other business to discuss.

Katie Reinsmidt made a motion to adjourn. Aon Miller seconded the motion. Daisy Madison adjourned the meeting.

#### CITY OF CHATTANOOGA GENERAL PENSION PLAN ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

Meeting of Trustees February 20, 2025

### PART I - PARTICIPANT SUMMARY

#### SUMMARY OF PENSION PLAN APPLICATIONS

				Monthly			
Name	Department	Type	Option	Amount	Effective Date	DROP	Notes
Rudolph, Gary L	Community Development	normal	C	\$1,033.78	8/1/2024		
McClure, Craig	Warner Park	imm early	D	\$478.55	9/1/2024		vested
Garner, Blondel	Early Learning	rule of 80	no	\$1,326.73	10/1/2024		
Carden, Vivian A	Public Works	normal	no	\$1,040.36	11/1/2024		
Sutherland, Chandra	Early Learning	rule of 80	no	\$2,225.94	11/1/2024	\$56,842.17	
Atterton, Glenn	Wastewater	normal	В	\$823.62	12/1/2024		
Bowman, Arnold	Public Works	rule of 80	В	\$2,936.83	1/1/2025	\$121,399.10	
Guy, Debbie	Human Resources	normal	no	\$790.73	1/1/2025		
Horne, Willie	General Government	normal	C	\$1,996.33	1/1/2025		
Johnson, Bowry	Early Learning	normal	no	\$1,399.15	1/1/2025		
Munson, Kathy	Early Learning	normal	В	\$1,887.39	1/1/2025	\$93,572,20	
Odom, Edward	Community Development	normal	no	\$3,401.46	1/1/2025		
Sherrer, David	Public Works	normal	no	\$904.48	1/1/2025		
Usry, Michael	Public Works	normal	D	\$1,749.45	1/1/2025		
Vance, Marva	Early Learning	normal	no	\$1,375.68	1/1/2025	\$67,904.47	
Wilson, William Darryl	Parks and Outdoors	normal	E	\$2,026.69	1/1/2025		
Womac, Terry	Fire Chief's office	normal	no	\$2,544.51	1/1/2025		
Bradley, Edward E	Airport	normal	В	\$1,066.67	2/1/2025		
Ford, Wilford Bernard	Tech servuces	normal	no	\$2,430.59	2/1/2025	\$100,157.28	
Moses, Dean	Airport	normal	C	\$1,164.50	2/1/2025		vested
Parker, Glenn D	Public Works	normal	no	\$741.85	2/1/2025		
Powell, Nancy S	Police services	normal	no	\$740.67	2/1/2025		
Trotter, Willard Gene	Public Works	rule of 80	В	\$3,022.17	2/1/2025		
Carr, James O	Parks and Outdoors	normal	no	\$594.62	3/1/2025		
Davis, Andria	Library	normal	no	\$2,883.38	3/1/2025		
Lawrence, Steven	Public Works	normal	D	\$444.87	3/1/2025		
Serrano, Diane	Public Works	normal	no	\$316.12	4/1/2025		

27 \$41,347.12 \$439,875.22

DEATH BENEFITS - DECEASED ACTIVE OR VESTED EMPLOYEES

Amount or

Monthly

Name Employee Type Option Date of Death Amount Effective Date Notes Charles Dupree Carol Berz normal A 12/11/2024 \$665.20 1/1/2025

BENEFIT REVISIONS/CONVERSIONS - PENDING BOARD REVIEW/APPROVAL

Previous

amount

NAME TYPE Option approved Revised amount Effective date

# SELECTION OF OPTIONAL BENEFIT REPORT - VESTED OR ATTAINED AGE 62 OR GREATER

Pre-Retirement option election

NAME

OPTION

Effective Date

DISABILITY BENEFIT REPORT

Insurance

Employee

Benefit Amount

NAME

Number

Effective Date

Notes

LUMP SUM DISTRIBUTIONS (FOR RATIFICATION - CHECKS PROCESSED)

TYPE

Return of contributions	`		23	\$27,012.92	
		Employee	Termination	Refund	
NAME	Department	Number	Date	Amount	Notes
White, Christopher S.	Public Works	62391	12/1/2010	\$7,811.44	vested
Ervin, Jenai R	Early Learning	101855	8/5/2024	\$1,143.62	
Kilgore, Brandon	Wastewater	103971	8/6/2024	\$193.11	
Cutcliff, Anthony C	Technology Services	103571	8/8/2024	\$292.99	
Parks, Nicholas J	Public Works	103487	8/8/2024	\$373.20	
Smartt, Laura	Early Learning	103267	8/12/2024	\$409.13	
Kennedy, Alexis A	Community Developr	r 84423	8/15/2024	\$713.00	
Hawkins, Tamisha L	Public Works	103481	8/19/2024	\$380.14	
Morgan, Tyesha M	Early Learning	101536	8/23/2024	\$583.55	
Owten, Chelsea N	Community Developr	72857	8/26/2024	\$83.24	
Decker, Amanda M	Police services	100866	8/30/2024	\$2,320.91	
Moniot, Nicholas A	Parks and Outdoors	102347	9/1/2024	\$912.25	
Silvels, Sherrese	Technology services	75317	9/5/2024	\$1,523.37	
Cain, Tammy R	Early Learning	100962	9/6/2024	\$1,417.46	
Green, Christopher D	Public Works	104080	9/10/2024	\$211.07	
Entwhistle, Hayden	Parks and Outdoors	100770	9/10/2024	\$1,518.92	
Oliver, Michael	Public Works	88641	9/19/2024	\$2,952.79	
Sanchez, Kathryn K	Purchasing	103570	9/19/2024	\$535.81	
Lewis, Jesse L	Public Works	102561	9/20/2024	\$993.58	
Gilbert, Vyron L	Traffic Ops	102712	9/20/2024	\$672.40	
Nash, Jonathan P	Public Works	103880	9/20/2024	\$350.45	
Asher, Sarah M	Parks and Outdoors	102422	9/27/2024	\$401.60	
Glosup, Melissa M	Library	100111	12/4/2024	\$1,218.89	

RETURN OF DECEASED RETIREE BASIS

Refund

Name Kathy Prophater Amy Moore Bianca Chatman RETIREE NAME Nancy Swearengin Sandra Moore Mary Green

Date of Death Amount 9/24/2024 9/28/2024 10/1/2024

\$1,046,19 \$611.67 \$119.93 Notes

# PART II -- ACCOUNT SUMMARY

## **ACCOUNTS PAID**

2312()24

COMPANY	AMOUNT PAID	Qtr Ending	PURPOSE
Current quarter	58,877.76	12/31/2024	
Fiscal Year to date	127,633.71		FY2025
Budget	392,186.00		FY2025
Same quarter last year	58,465.17	12/31/2023	
Prior Fiscal Year Actual	336,583.01		FY2024
Cavanaugh Macdonald	:=	12/31/2024	GPP valuation
Cavanaugh Macdonald	<del>;=</del> 0	12/31/2024	GPP GASB 67 & 68
Cavanaugh Macdonald	-	12/31/2024	Experience Study
Cavanaugh Macdonald	~	12/31/2024	Consulting service
Records Management	: <del>5</del> :	12/31/2024	Minutes, supplies
Chattanooga Times Free Press	88.38	12/31/2024	Meeting ad
CBIZ IAS	25,000.00	12/31/2024	Investment consulting services
First Horizon Bank	33,789.38	12/31/2024	Administrative expense
City of Chattanooga services		12/31/2024	Administrative expense annual
COMPANY TOTAL	58,877.76		

# Investment Managers -- Fees Paid

COMPANY	AMOUNT PAID	Qtr Ending	PURPOSE
Current quarter	130,681.74	12/31/2024	
Fiscal Year to date	260,966.09		FY2025
Same quarter last year	111,595.10	12/31/2023	
Total Prior Fiscal Year	463,876.29		FY2024
Kennedy Capital Mgmt	44,415.00	12/31/2024	Investment management fees
Patten & Patten	23,395.67	12/31/2024	Investment management fees
Kerusso Capital Management	13,581.53	12/31/2024	Investment management fees
Wedge Capital	49,289.54	12/31/2024	Investment management fees
MANAGER TOTAL	130,681.74		

#### ACCOUNTS RECEIVED

COMPANY Fiscal Year to date Fiscal Year to date Fiscal Year to date	AMOUNT RECEIVED	FYTD 1,385,009.35 691,102.56 615,002.00	FY2024	REASON
	Qtr Ending	12/31/2024	•	
DTC Diversified Partners III	\$0.00			distribution check 9/10/2024
TerraCap Partners III	\$0.00			distribution
TerraCap V	\$0.00			distribution
GoldenTree Distressed Fund 2014	\$0.00			distribution
GoldenTree Distressed Fund III	\$25,600.00			distribution
GoldenTree Distressed Debt IV	\$0.00			distribution
Medley Opportunity Fund III	\$0.00			distribution
Greenspring Global Partners IV	\$0.00			distribution
Greenspring Opportunity Fund III	\$0.00			distribution
FCA Venture Partners III	\$0.00		THE TWO	distribution - Final

COMPANY TOTAL	25,600.00				
REPORT OF MISCELLA	NEOUS ACCOUNT TRANS	SACTIONS			
COMPANY	AMOUNT	FYTD	EFF DATE	REASON	

Fiscal Year to date - FY2025 capital call

Fiscal Year to date 0.00 FY2025 all other transactions

cash 2,000,000 to pay benefits

Pointer Offshore Ltd -2,000,000 approved transaction 12/13/2024

GoldenTree Distressed Debt IV capital call

MISCELLANEOUS TOTAL 0.00 0.00

## REPORT OF ACCOUNT(S) PAID

ГОТAL	28,666.11	55,400.15		
Symetra				Long Term Disability (30%)
×.	-			Long Term Disability (50%)
Symetra	9,620.44		12/1/2024	Long Term Disability (50%)
Symetra	9,536.42		11/1/2024	Long Term Disability (50%)
Symetra	9,509.25		10/1/2024	Long Term Disability (50%)
Fiscal Year to date		55,400.15		FY2025
Budget		107,500.00		FY2025
Total Prior Fiscal Year		104,752.34		FY2024
COMPANY	THIS PERIOD	FYTD		PURPOSE
	AMOUNT	PAID	MONTH	

# CITY OF CHATTANOOGA OPEB TRUST ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

D A	DТ	TT	A	CCO	TINT	SHIM	MARY
$\mathbf{r}_{\mathbf{A}}$	KI	ш	P	LUUU	UINI	SOLVI	UVLANT

12/31/2024

ACCOUNTS	PAID
	COM

COMPANY	AMOUNT PAID	Qtr Ending	PURPOSE
Current quarter	14,193.89	12/31/2024	
Fiscal Year to date	36,208.40	FY2025	
Budget	78,190.00	FY2025	
Same quarter last year	13,180.66	12/31/2023	
Total Prior Fiscal Year Actual	75,929.05	FY2024	

Cavanaugh Macdonald	9	12/31/2024 OPEB valuation
Cavanaugh Macdonald	g.	12/31/2024 OPEB GASB 74/75

CBIZ IAS	5,000.00	12/31/2024 Investment consulting services
----------	----------	---

E' . 17 ' D 1	0.102.90	12/31/2024 Administrative Expense
First Horizon Bank	9,193.89	12/31/2024 Administrative Expense

14,193.89

Investment	Managers -	Fees	Paid
A P COLITICITY	174 WILLIAM CIT		

COMPANY AMOUNT PAID Qtr Ending PURPO	COMPANY	AMOUNT PAID	Qtr Ending	PURPO
--------------------------------------	---------	-------------	------------	-------

Fiscal Year prior		
Fiscal Year to Date	25,892.42	12/31/2024

Kerusso	25,892.42	12/31/2024
MANAGER TOTAL	25,892.42	

#### ACCOUNTS RECEIVED

AMOUNT	
--------	--

COMBANIZ	RECEIVED	EFF DATE	DEASON
COMPANY	RECEIVED	EFF DATE	KEASUN

Prior quarter total

GoldenTree /Distressed Co-Investment Fund	\$0.00	12/31/2024 distribution
Greenspring Opportunities Fund VII	\$0.00	12/31/2024 distribution

### COMPANY TOTAL

### REPORT OF MISCELLANEOUS ACCOUNT TRANSACTIONS

COMPANY	<b>AMOUNT</b>	EFF DATE	REASON
Fiscal year to date	1,50	FY2025	capital calls
Fiscal year to date		FY2025	all other transactions

Cash	-12,000,000	approved transaction 11/21/2024
Pointer Offshore Ltd	2,000,000	approved transaction 11/21/2024
Ironwood International Ltd	2,000,000	approved transaction 11/21/2024
Eaton Vance Multi-Asset Credit Fund	4,000,000	approved transaction 11/21/2024
Johnson Institutional Core Bond Fund	4,000,000	approved transaction 11/21/2024

GoldenTree Distressed Co-Investment Fund III	capital call
StepStone VC Opportunities VII	capital call

MISCELLANEOUS TOTAL	0.00	0.00	

APPROVED:

Dany w - Malison

Secretary