



# CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION



## MEETING MINUTES

March 21, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on March 21st, 2024, at 9:30 a.m. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center Building. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Administrative Support Specialist Shelby Ogle called the roll. Nia York swore in all those who would be addressing the Committee.

**Roll Call:** Shelby Ogle called the roll.

**Members Present:** Skip Pond, Matt McDonald, Nathan Bird, John Brennan, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Dana Moody

**Members Absent:** Todd Morgan

**Staff Members Present:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline, Admin Support Shelby Ogle, and Staff Attorneys Andrew Trundle and Chris McKnight

**Swearing In:** Nia York swore in people addressing the Committee.

**Applicant(s) Present:** Leah Golden, Philip Carlson, Ross Young, Erin Hicks, Matt Whitaker, Angela Haygood/Ashley Williams, Mike Bridges, Gabe Whitman, Chris Gehard, Nelson McDaniel

**Rules and Regulations:** Chair Skip Pond explained the rules and procedures, order of business, and announced the meeting is being recorded.

**Approve Minutes:** Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the February Minutes. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the February Minutes were approved.

---

## OLD BUSINESS

### - HZ-23-171 - 4425 Seneca Ave. - New Construction

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.22 New Construction Page 52, 6.9 Driveways and Paving Page 41

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Philip Carlson of 4425 Seneca Ave, presented to the Commission that building plans were updated to show the project was adjusted from a two-story structure to a one and half story structure to match the neighboring buildings; as requested by the Commission.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission asked the applicant a few questions regarding the plans.

Matt McDonald made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-23-171 - 4425 Seneca Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

- **HZ-23-190 - 511 Central Ave. - Fence: Violation**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 3.5 Fences, Walls, and Walks

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Nelson McDaniel of 511 Central Ave (apt 1), presented to the Commission that the 6ft fence was needed to contain their guard dog, a 100 lb cane corso named Tank, and they were granted permission from their landlord and thought that was all they needed to proceed with building the fence. The applicant then spoke about the Fair Housing Act and ADA requirements.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission had a lengthy discussion in regards to this case. It was mentioned that the ADA and FHA only say that the applicants are entitled to have the dog and do not mention any guidelines for that and that it was up to the commission to decide if it was acceptable according to the guidelines. The commission went back and forth in regards to the guidelines vs what was already in the community in use. Some members of the commission are worried about the precedent that would be set if the case was approved as is.

Clif McCormick made a motion to **DENY** case #: HZ-23-190 - 511 Central Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines. Dana Moody seconded the motion.

**5 in favor, 2 opposed. The motion carries.**

---

## **NEW BUSINESS**

- **HZ-24-8 - 508 Fortwood Place - Roof Replacement**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 4.6 Roof, Page 42

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Lea Golden of 508 Fortwood Place, presented to the Commission that the roof desperately needs replaced. It has caused considerable damage inside the home due to water leaking through. Replacing with a slate roof is not cost effective for applicant at this time and requests to be able to use asphalt shingles instead. Applicant also mentioned that most of the roof is not visible from ground level.

**Community Response:** Community member Bill Glascock of 924 Fortwood St, spoke in support of the roof replacement.

**Applicant Response to Community:** Applicant stated that they have spent a lot of time and funds to try to repair the roof, but at this point it needs to be replaced.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission had a lengthy discussion in regards to this case and asked the applicant several questions in regards to the gutters and chimney stacks. The commission also spoke to the applicant about the possibility of using slate-like materials instead, applicant stated that those materials are still not financially possible. The commission then discussed the visibility of the roof from the street.

Matt McDonald made a motion to **APPROVE case #: HZ-24-8 - 509 Fortwood Place.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- This is not intended to set precedent. An exception was made due to the fact that the roof is not visible from street views.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**6 in favor, 1 opposed. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-10 - 5506 St. Elmo Ave. - Exterior Rehabilitation: Violation**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.8 Doors, Page 40, 6.13 Foundations, Page 45, 6.25 Porches, Porch Columns Railings, Page 59, 6.27 Roofs, Page 62, 6.33 Siding, Page 70, 6.41 Windows, Page 74

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Erin Hicks of 5506 St Elmo Ave., presented to the Commission that they were told that the contractor had all the necessary permits and permissions to begin the rehabilitation. Applicant would like direction from the commission to bring the project into compliance.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission had a lengthy discussion in regards to this case and asked the applicant several questions in regards to the work already completed and in progress. The commission was disappointed that elements of the historic Victorian accents of the home were gone. The commission went through all the work that was already completed and the plans for the rest of the work to be done. They would like to see some changes made to the plans and designs before making a decision.

Piper Stromatt made a motion to **DEFER case #: HZ-24-10 - 5506 St Elmo Ave.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Brackets/columns to match in kind to Victorian style.
- Siding to be presented with a smaller reveal.
- Deck to remain as is.
- Rear steel door to be replaced in like kind.
- Single full light rear door to remain as is.
- Front porch to remain as is.
- Front door to represent the original era.
- Brick to be repointed.

- Block to be stuccoed.
- STOP WORK ORDER DOES NOT PROHIBIT INTERIOR WORK.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-11 - 850 Oak St. - Window and Front Door Replacement**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 4.4 Windows, Page 39

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Mike Bridges (architect) of 850 Oak St., presented to the commission that some of the windows need to be replaced due to them being rotted, painted shut (and not operational), or missing/boarded up. Applicant would like to replace the front door with a historic door that follows the era of the house.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed the replacement of the door and agrees that the door needs to be replaced with a period correct door. The commission discussed trying to retain as many original windows as possible. They also said that the windows need to match the original style and design.

Clif McCormick made a motion to **APPROVE case #: HZ-24-11 - 850 Oak St.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Existing windows indicated to remain may be repaired per application.
- Window replacement only allowed where existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair or missing (must be approved by staff).
- 2 over 2 windows are not approved. 1 over 1 windows are required.
- Current door design not approved by the commission; new design to be resubmitted for staff approval.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-12 - 5205 Tennessee Ave. - New Construction: House**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.22 New Construction, Page 52, 6.9 Driveways and Paving, Page 41

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Ross Young (architect) of 5205 Tennessee Ave., presented to the commission that the shed that is still on the property needs to be demolished due to the worn down condition. They plan to clean up the overgrowth in the alley and add a concrete pad to the back of the house that will not be visible.

**Community Response:** Email from a member of the community concerned about the siding.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response from applicant.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed the pedestrian and garage door designs and placements. They asked the applicant several questions about the designs.

John Brennan made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-12 - 5205 Tennessee Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-14 - 4618 Florida Ave. - New Construction: Outbuilding**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.22 New Construction, Page 52

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Angela Haygood (and fiancé, Ashley Williams) of 4618 Florida Ave, presents to the commission that she is getting married and fiancé is into woodworking and carpentry. They would like to build a new shed in the back of the property to accommodate those hobbies.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed that the design plan does not match the architecture of the house. They discussed that the materials shown to be used were okay, but they would like to see the roof and windows adjusted to match the house better.

Dana Moody made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-14 - 4618 Florida Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Pending staff approval of window and roof designs to match the house.

John Brennan seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

Dana Moody left the meeting around 10:45 a.m. - still have a quorum.

**- HZ-24-15 - 4616 Florida Ave. - New Construction: Carport**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.22 New Construction, Page 52

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Matt Whitaker of 4616 Florida Ave., presents to the commission that the design is similar to another carport that was approved and built in the same neighborhood.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed whether they just approve this design when it doesn't entirely match the house, when adjustments were needed on a very similar case. It was discussed that there was enough similarity between the design of the carport and the house that it would work, and also that any change to the roof could compromise the functionality of the carport.

Piper Stromatt made a motion to **APPROVE case #: HZ-24-15 - 4616 Florida Ave.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Matt McDonald seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-17 - 1222 W. 55th St. - New Construction: Addition**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 6.1 Additions, Page 33

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Chris Gehard of 1222 W. 55th St., presents to the board that there is no room at the back of the house to put the addition in without going into the setback. A side addition is the only option given the layout of the property. Applicant stated that currently there is no overhang on the gables and the windows beneath are starting to rot because of it, so he would like to add a short overhang. He will also be redoing the shutters using wood from a very old white oak from St. Elmo. The addition will go towards the driveway on the property.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed that this addition changes the scale of the house. The commission discussed how the proposed changes would cause the original historic characteristics of the house to potentially be lost.

Matt McDonald made a motion to **APPROVE case #: HZ-24-17 - 12222 W 55th St.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**5 in favor, 1 opposed. The motion carries.**

**- HZ-24-18 - 220 Eveningside Dr. - Exterior Rehabilitation**

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:** 5.B Entrances, Porches, and Steps, Page 12, 5.C Windows and Doors, Page 13, 5.E Materials, Page Page 15

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Gabe Whitman of 220 Eveningside Dr, presents to the commission that they are just wanting to bring the house back to life. The house itself is not historical, but it is in a historical district. The applicant wants to remove the wheelchair ramp and replace the deck. Applicant does not want to do the cable rod design that was originally submitted. They will remove the shutters, and update the gutters and windows.

**Community Response:** No community response.

**Applicant Response to Community:** No response needed.

**Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote:** The commission discussed the excitement the community has for this property to be updated and rehabilitated. They agree with the applicant that cable rods would not be best, but for standard wood balusters to be used instead.

John Brenann made a motion to **APPROVE case #: HZ-24-18 - 220 Eveningside Dr.**, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Deck balusters to be of wood material and 2" by 2" design.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries.**

---

## **Final Information/Staff Updates**

**Next Meeting Date:** April 18, 2024 (Application deadline is March 22, 2024 at 4pm).

**Other Information:** Staff will send out a survey to the commission for feedback on the meeting process and other things. Staff updated the commission on the consultant for the guidelines update.

**Nathan Bird made a motion to adjourn. Clif McCormick seconded the motion.**

**All in favor, the meeting was adjourned at 12:13 PM.**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Skip Pond, Chair

4/18/2024  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Shelby Oglesby, Admin

4-18-24  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

