

Meeting Minutes

November 16, 2023

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on November 16th, 2023, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order, Andrew Pinion called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Skip Pond, John Brennan, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Nathan Bird, Matt McDonald, Dana Moody, Todd Morgan

Members Absent: Leanne Kinney

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer, Administrative Support Assistant II Andrew Pinion, Attorney Andrew Trundle

Applicants Present: Debbie Sue Przybysz, Philip Cook, Louis Shapiro, Amber Clark, David Rowe, Daryl Smith, Nate Paulk, Denise Shaw, Glenn Stegall, Gary Whitehead-Nudd

Old Business:

HZ-23-64: 4513 Virginia Ave: Windows Replacement

The Applicant Glenn Stegall has the following:

- Windows Replacement

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.41 Windows: Page 74

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-64 – 4513 Virginia Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

1. This is the best solution to an enforcement case and is not meant to set a precedent.

Dana Moody seconded the motion. 7 members approved with 1 being opposed. The motion was carries to approve.

New Business:

- October Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for October to the Commission:

1. **HZ-23-124: 821 Vine St** - Tree removal
2. **HZ-23-125: 946 Vine St** - Tree removal
3. **HZ-23-140: 900 Oak St** - New shingles in cobblestone grey, new copper flashing, gutters lined with grey TPO
4. **HZ-23-141: 900 Vine St** - In-kind replacement of second story deck due to rot and deterioration

5. HZ-23-143: 108 Everett St - In-kind rehab porches, windows, siding, and driveway.
6. HZ-23-144: 5405 Ansley Dr - Backyard deck construction
7. HZ-23-145: 4015 Tennessee Ave - New retaining wall made of engineered block
8. HZ-23-146: 202 Morningside Dr - Backyard wood deck
9. HZ-23-149: 1001 E 5th St - In-kind rehab of rot on exterior, rehab and reinstall windows

Case #HZ-23-107 – 4404 Tennessee Ave. – Enforcement Railing and Fence

Project Description:

The Applicant Louis Schapiro has the following:

- Enforcement on railings and fence.

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.11 Fences Page 43

6.25 Porches, columns and railings, Page 59

Comments from the community:

Applicant Louis Shapiro 4404 Tennessee Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission. The fence originally had horizontal slats. He decided to change to diagonal when original fence deteriorated over time. Painted railings/flower boxes to help them blend in with the surrounding area.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Nathaniel Bird made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-107 – 4404 Tennessee Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

No Conditions.

Cliff McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.

Case #HZ-23-116 – 1708 W 56th St. – Side Addition

Project Description:

The applicant Philip Cook 1508 W 56th St. has the following:

- Side Addition

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions, Page 33

Applicant Philip Cook 1708 W 56th St. - spoke about the project and explained project in further detail to the Commission. The side addition is for a second bathroom and plans on reusing the exterior door as new bathroom door.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Todd Morgan made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-116, 1708 W 56th St, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions.

1. Reusing the existing exterior door as the new bathroom door

Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.

Case #HZ-23-129 – 5203 Beulah Ave– New Construction

Project Description:

Applicant Amber Clark 5203 Beulah Ave has the following:

- New Construction

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.22 New Construction, Page 52
- 6.9 Driveways and Paving, Page 41
- 6.18 Lighting, Page 49
- 6.31 Shutters, Page 66

Applicant Amber Clark 5203 Beulah Ave spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission. The applicant had several issues that the committee addressed and felt that deferring the case was appropriate.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. John Brennan made a motion to defer Case HZ-23-129 5203 Beulah Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines.

Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to defer.

Cliff McCormick leaves meeting at 10:50 AM

Case #HZ-23-132 – 1502 W 45th St – Renovations

Project Description:

Applicant Lauren Dunn 4501 Tennessee Ave has the following:

- Addition and porch remodel.

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.1 Additions Page 33
- 6.25 Porches, Porch Columns and Railings Page 59
- 6.41 windows, Page 74
- 6.15 Gutters, Page 47

Applicant Lauren Dunn (on behalf of Chylea Rowe) 4501 Tennessee Ave spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Chyela Row 1502 W 45th St spoke in favor of the project and spoke more in depth to the commission regarding the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Nathaniel Bird made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-132, 1502 W 45th St., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

1. Option for 2” square balusters if needed.
2. Window sashes to match existing in proportion
3. Existing exterior walls to remain

John Brennan seconded the motion. 6 members approved with 1 being opposed, the motion was carried to approve.

Case #HZ-23-135 – 5501 Beulah Ave – Rehabilitation

Project Description:

Applicant Darryl Smith 5501 Beulah Ave has the following:

- Home Rehabilitation

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.33 Siding, Page 68
- 6.41 windows, Page 74
- 6.25 Porches, Porch Columns Railings, Page 59
- 6.8 Doors, Page 40

Applicant Darryl Smith 4301 St Elmo Ave spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission. The applicant has plans to remove vinyl siding and reuse existing wood siding. If all the existing wood siding cannot be saved, the applicant will replace with new. There are also plans to replace some windows, front porch alterations and front porch stairs to be replaced with wood.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-135 5501 Beulah Ave., as submitted pursuant to the

Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Appropriate style door to be approved by staff**
- 2. Omit window shutters**
- 3. Retain existing gable vent on façade, or replace w/ wooden equivalent to be staff approved**

Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.

Case #HZ-23-148 – 4711 Alabama Ave – Carport

Project Description:

Applicant Gary Whitehead-Nudd has the following:

- Carport

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

22. New Construction C. Secondary Buildings Page 56

Applicant Gary Whitehead-Nudd 4711 Alabama Ave spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission regarding the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-148, 4711 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject no conditions:

Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.

Nathan Bird leaves meeting at 11:27 AM

Case #HZ-23-151 – 1607 W 52nd St – Exterior Renovations, Addition

Project Description:

Applicant Nate Paulk 1606 W 52nd St has the following:

- Rear addition, siding, fence removal, driveway/walkway and window replacement

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions Page 33

6.22 Secondary Buildings, Page 56
6.33 Siding, Page 68
6.41 windows, Page 74
6.25 Porches, Porch Columns Railings, Page 59
6.8 Doors, Page 40
6.9 Driveways and Paving Page 41

Applicant Nate Paulk 1606 W 51st St spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission regarding the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-151, 1607 W 52nd St., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Garage door opening to remain as-is and door to be submitted for staff approval.**
- 2. Siding to be replaced in-kind w/ cedar shake or w/ an alternate wood.**
- 3. Existing rear door to move to front door.**
- 4. Existing window configuration at front elevation to be retained. Windows on sides and rear to remain as sliders and material to be aluminum clad.**

- 5. Exterior of addition may be fiber cement lap siding.**

Case #HZ-23-152 – 4614 Glynden Dr. – New Construction

Project Description:

The applicant Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St has the following:

- New construction of single-family home and ADU

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.22 New Construction, Page 22
6.9 Driveways and Paving Page 41

Applicant Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St. - spoke about the project and explained proposal in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Dana Moody made a motion to deny Case HZ-23-152, 4614 Glynden Dr, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines.

John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carries as denied.

Case #HZ-23-153 – 4923 Virginia Ave – New Construction

Project Description:

Debbie Sue Przybysz 4700 Florida Ave has the following:

- Exterior Renovations, Addition

Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.22 New Construction, Page 22

Applicant Debbie Sue Przybysz 4700 Florida Ave spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission regarding the proposal to build a shotgun style home in the vacant lot.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Matt McDonald a motion to approve Case HZ-23-153, 4923 Virginia Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

1. Front windows or ground level to be framed in wood.
2. Either option for siding is allowed.

John Brennan made a motion to adjourn. Matt McDonald seconded.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:20 p.m.



Skip Pond, Chairman

12/21/2023
Date



Andrew Pinion, Secretary

12/21/23
Date