

**Post-Audit Review 21-07:  
Public Works Facilities Maintenance**

**November 2022**

**City Auditor**

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE

**Senior Auditor**

Richard Walls, CPA, CIA, CMFO





# OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT

## Stan Sewell, City Auditor

November 16, 2022

To: Mayor Tim Kelly  
City Council Members

Subject: Post-Audit Review of Public Works Facilities Maintenance (Report #21-07)

Dear Mayor Kelly and City Council Members:

Attached is a summary report on the status of audit recommendations in our December 2021 Public Works Facilities Maintenance report. The purpose of this report is to confirm whether, and to what degree, management has implemented the recommendations made in the original audit.

The original audit concluded there was adherence to the current policy, but opportunities exists for improvement.

The audit had 7 recommendations to improve efficiency and effectiveness of the facilities maintenance process. At the time of this Post-Audit Review, four recommendations were not implemented, one was partially implemented, and two were implemented. Recommendations partially implemented and not implemented are herein reported to the Audit Committee for follow-up, as appropriate.

This Post-Audit Review consisted principally of inquiries of City personnel and examinations of various supporting documentation. It was substantially less in scope than an audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. The evidence obtained provided a reasonable basis for our conclusions; however, had an audit been performed, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you and our conclusions may have been modified.

Sincerely,

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE  
City Auditor

Attachment

cc:    **Audit Committee Members**  
      **Joda Thongnopnua, Chief of Staff**  
      **Brent Goldberg, Chief Financial Officer**  
      **Ryan Ewalt, Acting Administrator of Public Works**  
      **Julia Bursch, Deputy Chief Operating Officer**  
      **Bill Payne, City Engineer**  
      **Dennis Malone, Assistant City Engineer**  
      **Charlotte Hicks, Director of Facilities**  
      **Jim Arnette, TN Local Government Audit**

---

## RECOMMENDATIONS NOT IMPLEMENTED (4)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
1 We recommended Facilities Management review and update the Department of Public Works Policy: Facilities Management: DPW17. Consideration should be given to including sections on service level agreements, maintenance standards and record retention specific to facilities maintenance.	The Department of Public Works Policy: Facilities Management: DPW17 is expected to be updated by December 31, 2022.
2 We recommended Facilities Management plan and perform regular condition assessments for facilities to ensure they are being maintained properly.	Facilities Management is working on a condition assessment plan and the initial condition assessment for facilities is expected to be completed by March 31, 2023.
3 We recommended Facilities Management determine the proper staffing level and maintenance budget based on the building's square footage and replacement value.	The determination of the proper staffing level and maintenance budget based on the building's square footage and replacement value is contingent on the completion of the condition assessments for facilities, and is expected to be completed by March 31, 2023.
5 We recommended Facilities Management should review and enhance their close out process to ensure unsatisfactory and incomplete service requests are not closed out. The resumption of Cityworks (asset management system) should help correct the close out issue (See Recommendation 4).	A similar and related recommendation was made in the recent 311 Center Audit. 311 is collaborating with the Department of Technology Services and Public Works to address this issue. Management feels a new customer relationship management system will be required. The estimated implementation date is October 1, 2023.

---

## RECOMMENDATION PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED (1)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
6 We recommended Facilities Management optimize its PM program and set realistic goals to measure progress. The resumption of Cityworks (asset management system) should help correct the preventive maintenance issue (See Recommendation 4).	Preventive Maintenance work orders are being set up at appropriate intervals. HVAC and generator work orders are complete and fire extinguishers, fire suppression and backflow preventers are in process. The estimated implementation date is December 31, 2022.

---

## RECOMMENDATIONS FULLY IMPLEMENTED (2)

<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Actions Taken</b>
4 We recommended Facilities Management continue the implementation and use of its asset management system (Cityworks).	The implementation of Cityworks began in July 2021 and as of October 2022 the majority of service requests are entered into Cityworks as a work order. Only service requests fully completed in a short time frame, with no or little cost, are not entered into Cityworks, such as custodial service requests.
7 We recommended Facilities Management monitor energy consumption in order to develop and implement energy conservation programs.	The fiscal analyst for Facilities Management monitors energy consumption and the energy conservation program is coordinated by the Office of Sustainability.

### **City of Chattanooga Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline**

Internal Audit's Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline gives employees and citizens an avenue to report misconduct, waste or misuse of resources in any City facility or department.

Internal Audit contracts with a hotline vendor, Navex Global, to provide and maintain the reporting system. The third party system allows for anonymous reports. All reports are taken seriously and responded to in a timely manner. Reports to the hotline serve the public interest and assist the Office of Internal Audit in meeting high standards of public accountability.

To make a report, call 1-877-338-4452 or visit our website:

[www.chattanooga.gov/internal-audit](http://www.chattanooga.gov/internal-audit)

---