Post-Audit Review 23-07: Citywide Camera Management

June 2025

City Auditor Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE

Senior Auditor Richard Walls, CPA, CIA, CMFO





June 30, 2025

To: Mayor Tim Kelly

City Council Members

Subject: Post-Audit Review of Citywide Camera Management (Report #23-07)

Dear Mayor Kelly and City Council Members:

Attached is a summary report on the status of audit recommendations in our July 2024 Citywide Camera Management report. The purpose of this report is to confirm whether, and to what degree, management has implemented the recommendations made in the original audit.

The original audit concluded there are internal controls over a substantial portion of camera management operations, but opportunities exists for improvement.

The audit had 7 recommendations to improve efficiency and effectiveness of the camera management process. At the time of this Post-Audit Review, two recommendations were not implemented and five were implemented. Recommendations not implemented are herein reported to the Audit Committee for follow-up, as appropriate.

This Post-Audit Review consisted principally of inquiries of City personnel and examinations of various supporting documentation. It was substantially less in scope than an audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. The evidence obtained provided a reasonable basis for our conclusions; however, had an audit been performed, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you and our conclusions may have been modified.

Sincerely,

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE City Auditor

Attachment

cc: Audit Committee Members

Kevin Roig, Chief of Staff

Mande Green, Chief Operating Officer

Jerele Neeld, Chief Information Technology Officer

Annea Robinson, Deputy Chief Information Technology Officer

James Cutcliff, Director of Business and Finance Management, Technology Services

Karitsa Jones, Administrator – Department of Early Learning

Jerramy Wood, Administrator – Public Works

Ricky Colston, Director – Citywide Services

Kenneth Howell, Director – Fleet Management

Jim Arnette, TN Local Government Audit

RECOMMENDATIONS NOT IMPLEMENTED (2)

Recommendation

- 6 We recommended DTS implement the use of Al-driven video analytic solutions for surveillance cameras. By leveraging artificial intelligence technology, DTS may be able to enhance the capabilities of their surveillance system, improve security monitoring, and potentially automate certain surveillance tasks.
- 7 We recommended DTS assume responsibility for administration of all citywide surveillance cameras. This would include consultation on the proper camera, installation and placement, maintenance and repair, giving proper permissions. login and password management, retention and storage, as well as cybersecurity. Departments using Avigilon cameras would maintain their cameras while coordinating management oversight with DTS.

Actions Taken

The City AI committee has drafted a policy for the use of AI tools in city business. The draft is in the approval process. The city does have cameras with AI functionality built in, but it has not been activated.

The Fleet Management Division now uses DTS cameras. DTS plans to work with departments using other systems to maintain documentation and access to those systems.

RECOMMENDATIONS FULLY IMPLEMENTED (5)

Recommendation

- 1 We recommended DTS establish citywide written policies and procedures to manage and maintain its network of cameras. Input and feedback should be obtained from other relevant departments.
- We recommended DTS establish best practices to enhance the effectiveness of their surveillance camera systems. Best practices can be implemented through policies and procedures.
- We recommended Head Start cease audio recordings.
- We recommended departments comply with the security camera policy by posting signage informing the public of surveillance cameras.
- We recommended the policies and procedures state static cameras are the default to ensure full coverage of areas that have been identified as warranting the expense of surveillance and additionally state the factors/criteria necessary to justify cameras being on tour mode.

Actions Taken

The City Technology Committee approved the written policies and procedures on June 10, 2024. The policy was implemented and shared with all department heads via email on July 3, 2024. This policy can be accessed from DTS Confluence and the Landing (intranet).

The City Technology Committee approved the written policies and procedures on June 10, 2024. The policy was implemented and shared with all department heads via email on July 3, 2024. Best practices have been and will continue to be addressed through policy revisions.

This recommendation was immediately implemented.

Procedures for camera signage have been included in the policy. 300 camera warning labels have been posted on public access doors at city accessible buildings.

The policy was updated on June 27, 2024 to include this recommendation. Additionally, the Real Time Intelligence Center (RTIC) has tested PTZ model cameras and will continue to make camera recommendations.

City of Chattanooga Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline

Internal Audit's Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline gives employees and citizens an avenue to report misconduct, waste or misuse of resources in any City facility or department.

Internal Audit contracts with a hotline vendor, Navex Global, to provide and maintain the reporting system. The third party system allows for anonymous reports. All reports are taken seriously and responded to in a timely manner. Reports to the hotline serve the public interest and assist the Office of Internal Audit in meeting high standards of public accountability.

To make a report, call 1-877-338-4452 or visit our website: $\frac{www.chattanooga.gov/internal-audit}{}$