

# **CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

# **MEETING MINUTES**

# May 15th, 2025

Th 9:

Admin Support Shelby Oale called t	he roll

ne duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was neid on May 19th, 2029, 30 a.m. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center Building.
hairman Skip Pond called the meeting to order at 9:33 A.M.
oll Call: Admin Support Shelby Ogle called the roll.
lember Attendance:
☑ Clif McCormick
☐ Piper Stromatt
☑ Brandon Panganiban
☐ Todd Morgan
✓ John Cavett
☑ Cassie Courtney
☑ Nathan Bird
☐ Matt McDonald
☑ Skip Pond
WELCOME NEW MEMBER CASSIE COURTNEY!
taff Attendance:
✓ Presenter: Cassie Cline
Admin: Shelby Ogle
Admin: Karen Murphy Cannon
☑ City Attorney: Andrew Trundle
☑ City Attorney: Chris McKnight
wearing In: Admin Support Shelby Ogle swore in people addressing the Committee.
ules and Regulations: Chairman Skip Pond explained the rules and procedures, order of business, and nnounced the meeting is being recorded.
pprove Minutes: Chairman Skip Pond presented the April 17th, 2025 Meeting Minutes to be voted on. No mendments need to be made. <i>Clif McCormick</i> motioned to APPROVE the April minutes. <i>Nathan Bird</i>

seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries 6-0.

Staff Review Cases: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the Staff Review cases to the Commission.

- #Z-25-34: 5410 Tennessee Ave.: Siding Repair/Replacement, Repair Screened Porch
- HZ-25-35: 4708 Alabama Ave.: Fence
- HZ-25-39: 915 Oak St.: Reconstruct Second-Story Front Porch In-Kind, Re-install Architectural Details
- HZ-25-40: 93 McCallie Ave.: Reconstruct Rear Porch In-Kind
- HZ-25-41: 5312 St. Elmo Ave.: Fence

# **OLD BUSINESS**

- HZ-24-128: 4705 St. Elmo Ave.: Addition + Rear Porch, As-Built

## Staff Presentation:

Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

#### **Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.1 Additions, Page 336.6 Decks, Page 386.25 Porches, Porch Columns and Railings, Page 59

#### **Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Matt Lewis presented to the Commission that he is back before them for the change to the previously approved dormer and the back deck that was added. He stated that the way the plans were originally drawn had a major design flaw with the roofline and the way that all the roof pieces came together. He stated that the change was an onsite decision to make it look better and match the neighborhood. He also said that he believes that the change to the front porch railing looks more appropriate for the appearance of the house.

# Community Response:

No community comments.

# **Commission Discussion:**

The Commission began their discussion by asking Staff to go over what they originally approved and what they are going over today. They then discussed the change to the dormer and that they believe it is a better option than what was previously presented. They then discussed the other changes that were made and that the addition with the dormer is not very visible from the road. They stated that the focus would be on the front porch and they believe that the Applicant did a good job on it.

## Commission Motion and Vote:

Brandon Panganiban made a motion to APPROVE case #: HZ-24-128: 4705 St. Elmo Ave., with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

#### All in favor.

The motion carries 6-0.

HZ-24-56: 1402 W. 55th St.: New Construction; Facade Changes

# Staff Presentation:

Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

#### **Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.22 New Construction Page 52

# **Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Francesco Pizzuto presented to the Commission that they are wanting to soften the look of the home and were looking at making changes to the design. He stated that the newly proposed design would be better. He presented that the windows would not be operable and are there just for looks. He stated that they are wanting to change the window material and extend the front upper windows. They are also changing the two sets of windows to one long window set.

#### **Community Response:**

No community comments.

#### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commission began their discussion by asking the Applicant why they wanted to change the window materials and he stated that it was mostly cost driven. They then asked if the windows look the same as the originally proposed windows and he stated that they do. The Commission then asked the Applicant some questions about the foundation and the reveal of it. The Applicant stated that a maximum height for the foundation was already granted in the previous Certificate of Appropriateness.

#### **Commission Motion and Vote:**

Nathan Bird made a motion to APPROVE case #: HZ-24-56: 1402 W. 55th St., with no conditions.
 Brandon Panganiban seconded the motion.

#### All in favor.

The motion carries 6-0.

# **NEW BUSINESS**

HZ-25-36: 1711 W. 57th St.: Outbuilding

# **Staff Presentation:**

Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

#### **Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.22 New Construction, Page 52

# **Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Francisco Pizzuto presented to the Commission that it is a simple shed and that it sits in the back of the property. He stated that even though it is visible from the street, it should not be as visible due to the topography of the site. He stated that he is going to try to match the brick of the main house, the trim will all be lx4s, and that the siding is going to be regular lap siding.

#### **Community Response:**

No community comments.

# **Commission Discussion:**

The Commission began their discussion by asking the Applicant if they are planning to use vinyl windows for the shed to which he stated they were, but that Staff had confirmed that vinyl windows were approved for sheds. The Commission then asked if there was any lighting planned for the side of the shed and the Applicant stated that there was not. The Commission stated that it was a cool shed and then asked Staff some questions about previous cases that were approved to use vinyl windows.

#### **Commission Motion and Vote:**

- Clif McCormick made a motion to APPROVE case #: HZ-25-36: 1711 W. 57th St., with no conditions.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

#### All in favor.

The motion carries 6-0.

HZ-25-37: 4906 St. Elmo Ave.: Exterior Rehabilitation + Addition

#### **Staff Presentation:**

Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

#### Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions, Page 33
6.33 Siding, Page 70
6.2 Architectural Details and Features, Page 34
6.6 Decks, Page 38
6.8 Doors, Page 40
6.25 Porches, Porch Columns, and Railings, Page 59

# **Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Nate Paulk presented to the Commission that he reached out to Staff to request a walkthrough of the property. He stated that there is not much of the house that is original to the home anymore. He also said that there is another home that is almost identical to the layout of this home and they are drawing heavily from the design of that house for the proposed design of this one. He walked the Commission through several aspects of the house that are not historic, such as the columns. He stated that they are planning to build an addition to the house and they would lose some of the windows, but they are planning to keep the original openings. He then spoke on some material choices for aspects of the house. He then talked through several other design points of the proposed home design.

# **Community Response:**

No community comments.

#### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commission began the discussion by stating that it is very exciting to see the house rehabilitated. They asked Staff to clarify what all aspects of the proposal, she is comfortable doing a Staff approval on and if there was anything she wasn't. She informed them that she is comfortable with making all the proposed decisions. The Commission then asked the Applicant some questions about some specific design points that are existing and if they will stay or if the Applicant will remove them or replace them. They then asked the Applicant some questions about the addition, such as differentiating the existing home from the addition. They then inquired about the windows and the style of the proposed windows. The Applicant stated that they are replacing all the vinyl windows and restoring all the historic windows and have no plans to change the dimensions of the windows.

## **Commission Motion and Vote:**

- Clif McCormick made a motion to APPROVE case #: HZ-25-37: 4906 St. Elmo Ave., with the following condition(s):
  - The following items are to be Staff approved:
    - 1. Finial
    - 2, Front Porch Columns (5x5)
    - 3. Rear Deck Railing
    - 4. Size and Location of Window Placement Under Front Porch
    - 5. Front Door
  - Front porch concrete to remain as is.
  - No new exterior front stair.
  - Cement board siding reveal to match existing wood lap siding reveal.
  - Wood shake siding to match the shake siding on the turret.
  - Rebuild existing 6/1 windows.
  - New windows to be 1/1.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

#### All in favor.

The motion carries 6-0.

HZ-25-38: 4815 Virginia Ave.: Detached Garage

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

#### **Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.22 New Construction, Page 526.25 Porches, Porch Columns and Railings, Page 596.41 Windows, Page 74

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Daryl Smith presented to the Commission that they are proposing a detached garage that would have wood siding. He stated that there would be one window for the bathroom and they thought it would be appropriate to shrink the window, since that is where the main bathroom is. He stated that they want to stay in the same footprint. He spoke on some of the other windows in the home that need to be replaced due to not being a historic material or because they do not match the rest of the house. He then spoke on the porch and the columns as well as the gable.

Community Response: No community comments.

**Commission Discussion:** The Commission began their discussion by asking the Applicant some questions about the addition and the windows. They then spoke with the Applicant on some options for the windows based on the period the house was built in.

## **Commission Motion and Vote:**

- Clif McCormick made a motion to APPROVE case #: HZ-25-38: 4815 Virginia Ave., with the following condition(s):
  - Wood siding to be installed on the detached garage.
  - New bathroom window to be awning.
  - Replacement window by rear door to be same size, aluminum clad, configuration as selected by owner.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

#### All in favor.

# **Other Business**

Next Meeting Date: June 16th, 2025 (Application Deadline, May 16th, 2025 by 4 p.m.)

**Historic Guidelines Update:** The Commission received an update from Staff regarding the Historic Guidelines Update. She said that the Mayor's office has requested more time in reviewing them and that she is hoping that by the end of June or July they will be able to bring them to the Commission for review. The Commission then asked some questions about if there will be a grace period similar to the adoption of the new zoning code and if there will be the option to make revisions after the adoption of it.

Nathan Bird motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Clif McCormick seconded the motion.

All in favor.

Meeting was adjourned at 11:20 a.m..

Chairman

Data

Admin Assistant

Date