



# CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

## MEETING MINUTES

November 21st, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on November 21st, 2024, at 9:30 a.m. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center Building.

**Chairman Skip Pond called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m..**

**Roll Call:** Admin Support Shelby Ogle called the roll.

**Member Attendance:**

- Clif McCormick
- Piper Stromatt
- Brandon Panganiban
- Todd Morgan
- VACANT
- John Brennan
- Nathan Bird
- Matt McDonald
- Skip Pond

**Staff Attendance:**

- Presenter: Cassie Cline
- Admin: Shelby Ogle
- Admin: Karen Murphy Cannon
- City Attorney: Andrew Trundle
- City Attorney: Chris McKnight

**Swearing In:** Admin Support Shelby Ogle swore in people addressing the Committee.

**Rules and Regulations:** Chairman Skip Pond explained the rules and procedures, order of business, and announced the meeting is being recorded.

**Approve Minutes:** Chairman Skip Pond presented the October 17th, 2024 Meeting Minutes to be voted on. No amendments need to be made. *Matt McDonald* motioned to **APPROVE** the October minutes. *Todd Morgan* seconded the motion.

**All in favor. The motion carries 5-0.**

**Staff Review Cases:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the Staff Review cases to the Commission.

- **HZ-24-103:** Removal of screened porch, in-kind repairs for doors, windows, and siding
- **HZ-24-105:** In-kind repair/replacement of beadboard and shingles
- **HZ-24-107:** Fences + Replenish existing driveway with gravel
- **HZ-24-109:** Roof replacement
- **HZ-24-110:** Deck expansion, fire remediation repairs in-kind
- **HZ-24-111:** Gate replacement
- **HZ-24-112:** Fence + Concrete walkway

## OLD BUSINESS

No Old Business

---

## NEW BUSINESS

\*Point of Order\* Only 5 members present at this time- if a member leaves for any reason, there will not be a quorum.

### - HZ-24-99: 5408 St. Elmo Ave. : Shed + Privacy Fence

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.11 Fences, Page 43

6.22.C New Construction, Page 52

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Menden Poole presented to the Commission that she is fine with the fence being lower than 4ft in the front. She stated that the reason she wanted to bring the fence to the front of the house was to match the neighbor's fence. She said that her other neighbor and her share a wooden privacy fence that is not in good condition and she is hoping that neighbor will be willing to let her pay to take it down so they can put up the new privacy fence.

**Community Response:** No Community Comments.

**Discussion:** The Commission began their discussion by asking if the aluminum fence would be taken down and the Applicant stated that she would take it down and also the aluminum gate. She also informed the Commission that if her neighbor is willing, she would attach the new privacy fence to their chain link fence. The Commission asked for confirmation from Staff on the height of fences in the front yard and Staff confirmed that it is 3ft on average. The Commission discussed that the proposed shed looks good.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Todd Morgan* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-99: 5408 St. Elmo Ave., with the following condition:
  - Street facing front fence height is 36 inches high at maximum height.

*Nathan Bird* seconded the motion.

**All in favor.**

**The motion carries 5-0.**

### - HZ-24-100: 4614 Florida Ave.: Addition (Stop Work Order)

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.1 Additions, Page 33

6.41 Windows, Page 74

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicants Hank Beck and Donna Landry present to the Commission that they are wanting to remodel the kitchen to create more counter space, but they need to shorten the windows to allow for there to be no empty space behind the countertops and cabinets. They also are closing in a portion of the porch to allow more room in the kitchen and that you cannot see any of the work from the road as it is blocked by the garage. Staff asked for clarification about the exterior doors- the Applicant stated that there are 2 exterior doors and they only plan to keep one of the doors and move it to the side of the house.

**Community Response:** No Community Comments.

**Discussion:** The Commission started off by asking the Applicants for clarification about the new exterior wall and if it was being installed or not and the Applicant stated that they closed in some of the porch and they are reusing one of the doors that were removed at the side of the house and are storing the other door on property. The Commission then questioned the Applicant on if they had retained the pieces of the window that they took out and they stated that they still have the pieces, but some of the glass panes broke upon removal. The Commission then questioned the Applicant on some accent details for the addition and the other window.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Clif McCormick* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-100: 4614 Florida Ave., with the following conditions:
  - Maintain existing historic window sash and doors on site.
  - Retain trim between existing wall and infill of porch.

*Nathan Bird* seconded the motion.

**All in favor.**

**The motion carries 5-0.**

- **HZ-24-101: 4518 St. Elmo Ave: Foundation**

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.13 Foundations, Page 45

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant was not present.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Matt McDonald* made a motion to **MOVE** case #: HZ-24-100: 4614 Florida Ave., to the end of the agenda.  
*Nathan Bird* seconded the motion.  
**All in favor.**  
**The motion carries 5-0.**

- **HZ-24-102: 4718 Florida Ave.: Addition**

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.1 Additions, Page 33

6.27 Roofs, Page 27

6.31 Shutters, Page 66

6.6 Decks, Page 38

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Stephanie Pons presented to the Commission that the addition they are wanting to build would expand their kitchen and allow for a master bathroom on the second floor. She stated that their current roof is losing shingles and they believe that the proposed roof would better match the house and historic style of the neighborhood. They presented that the new addition would be just under 1,000 square feet and they would match the materials of the first floor to the house and the materials of the second floor would be lap siding. She presented that the deck they want to add to the side of the house would be built to match the front porch and they would be willing to add landscaping or something else the Commission recommends to shield it from view if that is desired.

**Community Response:** No Community Comments.

**Discussion:** The Commission started off by asking the Applicant if the exterior doorways would be used as interior for the new addition to which the Applicant stated that the current back door would be walled off and the new exterior opening would be on the side of the addition. She also stated that another door and several windows would need to be walled off. The Commission informed the Applicant that they would need to maintain the framing for the original openings within the new walls and the original windows and doors to remain on site. The Commission then discussed with the Applicant the roof materials and the materials for the addition as well as a way to differentiate the addition from the main house. They also discussed the shutters and decided that they could be Staff approved.

[Brandon Panganiban enters the meeting at 10:23 a.m.](#)

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Matt McDonald* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-102: 4718 Florida Ave., with the following conditions:
  - Maintain the framing of all doors and windows that are to be removed.
  - Maintain the original stone lintels and sills.
  - Applicant to provide a siding demarcation between old and new.
  - Applicant has the option to use wood siding on the first level.
  - Deck to have 2x2 wood or metal railing to match the front stairs railing.
  - Foundation covering to be brick.

*Nathan Bird* seconded the motion.

**All in favor.**

**The motion carries 6-0.**

- **HZ-24-104: 838 Vine St.: Front and Rear Porch**

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

4.2 Entrances and Porches, Page 37

4.3 Doors, Page 38

4.4 Windows, Page 39

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant Keith McCallie presented to the Commission that she is the contractor and designer for the owners of the property and that it has had quite a controversial history. She stated that the current owners bought it with the intention to make it their home and raise their kids there. She then went through the list of changes they are requesting to be approved, some of which include, adding an entry at the back of the house at the bottom floor and staining the railing and wood stairs. She presented that they are wanting to add in some windows to match the existing windows. She stated that they have done a lot of research on the front porch and the history of the house and the porch. They decided on a specific design of multiple smaller columns instead of singular bulky columns for the front porch. They believe that it makes the house more inviting and less bulky.

**Community Response:** No Community Comments.

**Discussion:** The Commission began their discussion by thanking the Applicant for taking the project on given the history and the controversy over the home. The Commission and the Applicant discussed at length the history of the house as it relates to the front porch and also the neighboring properties and their porch designs. They also discussed the changes to the window that are being requested. The Commission appreciated the Applicant for their presentation and their willingness to research and try to be true to the historic nature of the neighborhood.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Nathan Bird* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-104: 838 Vine St., with the following conditions:
  - Existing rear doorway to remain, door to be Staff approved.
  - Approval pending brick mock up reviewed by Commission.

*Clif McCormick* seconded the motion.

**4 in favor. 2 opposed.**

**The motion carries.**

- **HZ-24-106: 4811 Alabama Ave.: Addition, Garage, + Parking**

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.1 Additions, Page 33

6.9 Driveways & Paving, Page 41

6.22.C New Construction (Outbuildings), Page 52

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicants John Harris presented to the Commission that they are coming before them with several requests. He stated that they are a family of 5 and they do not have room on the current driveway where they can get in and out of the car without worrying about hitting something. He presented that they are wanting to build a garage for storage and a pool for the kids. He stated that they also want to put an addition on to assist with the flooding issue the house has currently.

**Community Response:** No Community Comments.

**Discussion:** The Commission began discussion by asking Staff if they were hearing the pool portion of the site plan and Staff informed them that pools are normally Staff approved. The Applicant stated that their priority right now is moving the driveway and building the garage and addition for functionality. The Commission asked the Applicant about the windows that would be removed for the addition and the Applicant stated that they can be repurposed on the addition. They then questioned the Applicant about the roof and the material choice for it. The Commission then invited Joe Melban, consultant for the project to speak. He stated that they decided to go with a metal material for the roof, because it was easiest to meet the slope requirements. He said that they would be open to suggestions from the Commission. He stated that they believe that certain windows are not original to the home and that the window that is being removed for the addition would remain a doorway that would enter the proposed closet. The Commission discussed the garage location with the Applicant as well as what the upper portion of the garage would be used for.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Nathan Bird* made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-106: 4811 Alabama Ave., with the following conditions:
  - Windows to be re-used or be stored on-site.
  - Pool not considered in this approval.
  - Driveway to be staff approved.

*Clif McCormick* seconded the motion.

**5 in favor. 1 opposed.**

**The motion carries.**

- **HZ-24-101: 4518 St. Elmo Ave: Foundation**

**Staff Presentation:** Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.13 Foundations, Page 45

**Applicant Presentation:** Applicant was not present.

**Commission Motion and Vote:**

- *Matt McDonald* made a motion to **DEFER** case #: HZ-24-100: 4614 Florida Ave., to the December meeting.  
*Nathan Bird* seconded the motion.

**All in favor.**

**The motion carries 6-0.**

---

**Other Business**

**Next Meeting Date:** December 19th, 2024 (Application deadline is November 22nd, 2024 at 4pm).

**Historic Guidelines Update:** The final draft of the guidelines updates should be distributed soon. The Commission asked Staff if they could make amendments to the guidelines and Staff stated that changes can be made after the updates are completed.

**Staff Update:** Staff wanted to let the Commission know that they are hoping to have everything in place to begin livestreaming the meetings and they hope to begin in December.

**Nathan Bird motioned to adjourn the meeting.**

**Matt McDonald seconded the motion.**

**All in favor.**

**Meeting was adjourned at 11:33 a.m..**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Skip Pond, Chairman

12/19/2024  
Date  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Admin Assistant

12-19-24  
Date